

Workshop on Key Comparison Data Evaluation: Panel discussion

**Maurice G Cox
National Physical Laboratory**

maurice.cox@npl.co.uk

Tsukuba, 16 May 2005

Panel discussion

Towards a framework for key comparison data evaluation

To what extent can a **generic framework** be developed that

Can **readily be tailored** to specific cases?

(and hence) assists in making the KC data
evaluation process **more efficient**

What might be the **constituent parts** of such a framework?

Possible aspects of a framework

1. State **design** of KC, e.g., circulation of single artefact measured by each participating NMI
2. State **hypothesis**, e.g., artefact stable throughout KC
3. State **model**, consistent with design of KC and hypothesis
4. **Fit** model to KC measurement data
5. **Test hypothesis**, i.e., determine extent of model-data consistency
6. If **consistent**, determine
 - a. **KCRV(s)** and associated uncertainty(ies)
 - b. Unilateral and bilateral **DoEs**
7. If inconsistent, ...

Possible aspects of a framework ctd

1. State **design** of KC, e.g., circulation of single artefact measured by each participating NMI
2. State **hypothesis**, e.g., artefact stable throughout KC
3. State **model**, consistent with design of KC and hypothesis
...
7. If **inconsistent**, using all available knowledge of KC:
 - a. Consider **different hypothesis**, i.e., return to Step 2, or
 - b. Consider **different model**, retaining hypothesis, i.e., return to Step 3, or
 - c. ***

Stages of framework development

1. Propose **initial form** for framework
2. Consider number of **KC data evaluation strategies**
3. Decide **extent** to which they fit the framework
4. **Modify/evolve** framework accordingly
5. Give **instantiations** of framework for main type of KCs, etc.

Possible merits of framework

1. Provides some **structure** to KC data evaluation problem
2. It would be used as **guidance** taking full account of knowledge of KC
3. It provides **set of considerations**, even if framework itself not actually followed

Discussion

Panel members (invited speakers)

Delegates